



CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS
OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
JOSEPH A. CURTATONE
MAYOR

PLANNING DIVISION

STAFF

GEORGE PROAKIS, *PLANNING DIRECTOR*

LORI MASSA, *SENIOR PLANNER*

ADAM DUCHESNEAU, *PLANNER*

DAWN PEREIRA, *ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANT*

FREDERICK J. LUND, *SENIOR DRAFTSMAN*

Case #: ZBA 2007-03-R4(2/2011)

Date: March 16, 2011

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

PLANNING STAFF REPORT

Site: 16 Butler Dr / 100 Temple St – St. Polycarp's Village

Applicant Name: Somerville Community Corp, Courtney Koslow

Applicant Address: 337 Somerville Ave, Somerville MA 02143

Property Owner Name: The St. Polycarp Redevelopment LLC

Property Owner Address: The St. Polycarp Redevelopment c/o Somerville Community Corp,
337 Somerville Ave, Somerville MA 02143

Alderman: Walter Pero

Legal Notice: Applicant, Somerville Community Corporation, & Owner, St. Polycarp Redevelopment, LLC, seek a revision to Special Permit ZBA 2007-03 (SZO §5.3.8). The revision is to modify the site and building design for Phase 3 of the development consisting of 31 residential units. The Applicant & Owner also seek a variance from providing approx 15 parking spaces.

Zoning District/Ward: NB / 4

Zoning Approval Sought: Revision to Special Permit (SZO §5.3.8) and Variance (§5.5)

Date of Application: February 9, 2011

Dates of Public Meeting • Hearing: Planning Board 3/3/11 • Zoning Board of Appeals 3/16/11

I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

1. Organization of Reports: The following report contains information and findings for the revision to the Special Permit with Site Plan Review. The requested variance is addressed in a related Planning Board recommendation dated March 3, 2011. This Staff report and the Planning Board recommendation contain different findings because the Planning Board is not required to make a recommendation on revisions to special permits, while they are required to make a recommendation on a variance case.



CITY HALL • 93 HIGHLAND AVENUE • SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS 02143
(617) 625-6600 EXT. 2500 • TTY: (617) 666-0001 • FAX: (617) 625-0722

www.somervillema.gov



Nonetheless, the Planning Board reviewed the entire plan set when making recommendations on the variance.

For this reason, the subject property description, proposal description, green building practices, and comments from City Departments can be found in the Planning Board recommendation along with the variance findings. At the time that the Planning Board made their recommendation the completed traffic memo was not available for the Planning Board. The City's Traffic and Parking Department's updated comments will be presented at the ZBA hearing.

2. Proposal: As noted above, the proposal is addressed in the Planning Board Recommendation. Since that recommendation was complete, details on the elevations have been finalized to address the Design Review Committees comments. The following contains a description of the design changes since the Design Review Committee meeting.

- The balcony depth was revised from 3 feet to 4 feet to make the space more usable and less likely to just be used as storage
- The lattice on the balconies is denser for added privacy
- Brackets were added to the balconies to improve their appearance
- The location of the horizontal trim band was brought down to the window sill
- Fiber cement panels were kept on the garage façade because the Applicant does not believe that concrete was successful on the ground floor of the building in Phase I.
- A retaining wall on the Mystic Street elevation was added to the elevation to account for the grading on the site. The retaining wall will be located to the on the northeast edge of the green in front of the building.
- The small landscaped areas are shown with bushes/vegetative ground cover.

The Design Review Committee would like to see the planting schedule and color scheme for Phase III when it is created.

In the revised drawings plantings are shown in the plaza in front of the church. SCC does not have site control over this portion of the property. They will work with the church owners and make best efforts to improve the condition of the pavement in this location.

3. Nature of Application: The variance request (SZO §5.5) is from parking requirements as required under §9.5 and §9.13 (Case #ZBA 2011-17). The Planning Board made a recommendation on this request which can be found in their report dated March 3, 2011.

The Applicant is also applying to make revisions to the SPSR under SZO §5.3.8 to modify the site plan and elevations of the building (Case # ZBA 2007-03-R4 (2/2011)). A Planning Board recommendation for revisions is not required. The applicable findings can be found below.

4. Impacts of Proposal: The revisions to the design of the building are an improvement over the design that was initially approved, as noted in the Site and Area Compatibility Finding below. The change to the site plan pulls many of the parking spaces under the building and due to the grade change on the site, they are less visible than they were in the prior approval. Consolidating the buildings allows for the installation of an elevator that will provide access to most units for people who are physical handicapped. The updated design creates a space that will be used as a large landscaped courtyard, providing a valuable recreational amenity.

II. FINDINGS FOR SPECIAL PERMIT (SZO §5.3.8):

There are not specific required findings for a revision to a special permit. Rather, staff review the original findings for the specific zoning relief requested and identify any findings that have changed as a result of the proposed revision. Below, staff have reviewed the findings that are affected by the revisions.

1. Compliance with Standards: The Applicant must comply "with such criteria or standards as may be set forth in this Ordinance which refer to the granting of the requested special permit."

The proposal complies with the standards for issuing revisions. The Certificate of Occupancy has not yet been issued, the proposal otherwise is in accordance with the originally approved plans and conditions, and notice has been given for the public hearing.

Design Guideline Standards

"Maintain a strong building presence along the primary street edge, continuing the established streetwall across the front of the site so as to retain the streetscape continuity; however, yards and setbacks as required by Article 8 shall be maintained." The L-shaped building will continue to create a street presence along Memorial Drive. The building footprint will be slightly longer than the "A" building in the prior approval that was along Memorial Drive.

"Make use of the typical bay widths, rhythms and dimensions prevalent in buildings adjacent to the site, especially in new construction or substantial redevelopment." The current design includes bays, recesses, balconies and fenestration that break up the massing of the building and tie this building into the Village concept for the site.

"Use materials and colors consistent with those dominant in the area or, in the case of a rehabilitation or addition, consistent with the architectural style and period of the existing building. Use of brick masonry is encouraged, but not considered mandatory." The materials will be consistent with the other Phases of the development. The Design Review Committee will review the final color pallet for the building.

2. Purpose of the District: In addition to the general purpose of the NB zoning district, specific standards and guidelines are also set forth in Article 6 of the SZO. Of the two standards and guidelines set forth, one is that "[W]hen a fourth floor is included, provide a minimum five (5) foot deep setback from the front lot line building wall, such as a balcony or deck, for the purpose of promoting a scale appropriate to surrounding neighborhoods." The proposal for Phase III has changed from four stories to three stories and therefore this standard is no longer applicable.

The second standard or guideline is, "Give preference to locating on-site, off-street parking at the rear of the lot, behind the building or below street level, providing vehicular access from either a side street or alley where possible." The revision to Phase III allows for much of the parking to be located under the building and it will only be visible from the eastern side of the building along the driveway out of the property.

3. Site and Area Compatibility: The Applicant has to ensure that the project "(i)s designed in a manner that is compatible with the characteristics of the built and unbuilt surrounding area, including land uses."

The revised design is more compatible than the original proposal. The façades will have a more residential appearance than the previously approved elevations. There will be more windows on the building and balconies, which will provide for a more interesting building and allows for tenants to interact with the outdoor spacing, making it more a more active site that will feel safer. The removal of the curved

canopies that previously lined the entire façade along the courtyard and replacing them with smaller canopies helps to differentiate the building entrances and break up the façade.

The revision to the cul-de-sac will not have a negative impact on the design if the pavement materials and markings chosen continue the intent for Butler Drive to be a pedestrian oriented spine of the “village”. This area will also act as a plaza and an extension of the useable open space in front of the building when the church is not using it for vehicular turning space if it is paved as such. Since this area is widened in the revised plans taking up more of the site, the materials used should be carefully considered when the details of this portion of the site are chosen.

5. Functional Design: The project must meet “accepted standards and criteria for the functional design of facilities, structures, and site construction.”

Condition 13 of the prior approval required the Applicant to create an interim plan for Butler drive that would be subject to Planning and Traffic and Parking staff approval. Condition 15 states that this plan should be completed before the building permit would be issued for phase II. The approved plan is for SCC to permanently cut off vehicular traffic at the intersection of Butler Drive, Temple Street and Memorial Road. At that time they would remove the temporary barricade on Butler Drive and create an opening onto Memorial Road behind the school. Vehicular traffic would then be able to access Butler Drive via Memorial Road or Mystic Ave. SCC will install 2 to 3 speed bumps or traffic calming tables and install a sign at the new access to Memorial Road that says “No left turns 7am-9am”. Due to coordination that needs to happen between this plan and the substantial road work project on Temple Street that is due to start this spring, the City Engineer is recommending that the timeframe for compliance for this condition be changed to the issuance of the certificate of occupancy for phase II. The change is noted below in condition 15.

IV. RECOMMENDATION

Based on the above findings and subject to the following conditions, the Planning Staff recommends **CONDITIONAL APPROVAL** of the requested **REVISIONS TO PRIOR PERMITS**. Changes from the existing conditions are shown below, with additions marked in underline, deletions in ~~strike through~~.

#	Condition	Timeframe for Compliance	Verified (initial)	Notes																				
1	Approval is for the phasing plan and revised master plan. This approval is based upon the following application materials and the plans submitted by the Applicant:	BP and CO for Phase I, II, & III	Plng.																					
	<table><tr><th>Date (Stamp Date)</th><th>Submission</th></tr><tr><td>January 25, 2007</td><td>Initial application submitted to the City Clerk's Office</td></tr><tr><td>February 8, 2007</td><td>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (site utility plan and topographic plan)</td></tr><tr><td>February 9, 2007</td><td>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (additional elevations)</td></tr><tr><td>March 1, 2007</td><td>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (supplemental traffic study report)</td></tr><tr><td>March 28 2009 (May 15, 2009)</td><td>Plans submitted to OSPCD (Phasing Plan)</td></tr><tr><td>May 19, 2009 (May 29, 2009)</td><td>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (revised site plan)</td></tr><tr><td>August 5, 2010</td><td>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (revised elevations A201D-F)</td></tr><tr><td><u>March 3, 2011</u></td><td><u>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (A100-104: phase 3 floor/roof plans)</u></td></tr><tr><td><u>March 9, 2011</u></td><td><u>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (L001: Site Plan A, 200-201: Phase 3 elevations)</u></td></tr></table>				Date (Stamp Date)	Submission	January 25, 2007	Initial application submitted to the City Clerk's Office	February 8, 2007	Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (site utility plan and topographic plan)	February 9, 2007	Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (additional elevations)	March 1, 2007	Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (supplemental traffic study report)	March 28 2009 (May 15, 2009)	Plans submitted to OSPCD (Phasing Plan)	May 19, 2009 (May 29, 2009)	Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (revised site plan)	August 5, 2010	Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (revised elevations A201D-F)	<u>March 3, 2011</u>	<u>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (A100-104: phase 3 floor/roof plans)</u>	<u>March 9, 2011</u>	<u>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (L001: Site Plan A, 200-201: Phase 3 elevations)</u>
	Date (Stamp Date)				Submission																			
	January 25, 2007				Initial application submitted to the City Clerk's Office																			
	February 8, 2007				Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (site utility plan and topographic plan)																			
	February 9, 2007				Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (additional elevations)																			
	March 1, 2007				Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (supplemental traffic study report)																			
	March 28 2009 (May 15, 2009)				Plans submitted to OSPCD (Phasing Plan)																			
	May 19, 2009 (May 29, 2009)				Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (revised site plan)																			
	August 5, 2010				Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (revised elevations A201D-F)																			
<u>March 3, 2011</u>	<u>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (A100-104: phase 3 floor/roof plans)</u>																							
<u>March 9, 2011</u>	<u>Modified plans submitted to OSPCD (L001: Site Plan A, 200-201: Phase 3 elevations)</u>																							
Any changes to the approved site plan, elevations or use that are not <i>de minimis</i> must receive ZBA approval.																								
2	A written certification of the creation of affordable housing units, any fractional payment required, or alternative methods of compliance, must be obtained from the Housing Department.	CO for Phase I, II, & III	Housing																					

3	That the granting of this permit subject to the building being completed in accordance with plans filed and in accordance with the requirements of the Fire Prevention Bureau and fire safety code, and as evidenced by a Certificate of Compliance being granted prior to the issuance of an Occupancy Permit.	CO for Phase I, II, & III	Fire Prevention	
4	The Applicant shall provide colored material samples of the fiber cement panels, trim, and lap siding for Buildings D, E, and F to the Planning Director for review and approval prior to issuance of building permit.	Building Permit for Phase II	Plng.	Complete
5	The Applicant shall install audible warning devices at all signalized intersections (Temple at Mystic, Temple at Jacques, Temple at Broadway, and Broadway at School) and replace older audible devices with newer, updated versions.	CO for Phase II	T&P	
6	The Applicant shall reapply with thermoplastic, all pavement markings (including, but not limited to the following: double yellow center lines, stop lines, edge lines, arrows, etc.) along the Temple Street corridor from Mystic Avenue to Broadway at School Street.	CO for Phase II	T&P	
7	The Applicant shall replace all City installed warning, regular, and guide signs (approximately 15 'street cleaning', 12 street name blades, 11 'no parking anytime', 3 'no turn on red', 2 'loading zone', 1 'pedestrian crossing', 1 'no u turn') with similar signs with high intensity prismatic sheeting.	Where applicable for CO for Phase I, II, & III	T&P	
8	The Applicant shall provide three pedestrian impact recovery systems along or adjacent to the Temple Street corridor to be installed by Traffic and Parking at the discretion of the Ward Alderman.	CO for Phase II	T&P	
9	That the Applicant, its successors and/or assigns, shall be responsible for maintenance of both the building and all on-site amenities, including landscaping, fencing, lighting, parking areas and storm water systems, ensuring they are clean, well kept and in good and safe working order.	Perpetual	ISD	
10	That the Applicant shall at his expense replace any existing equipment (including, but not limited to street sign poles, signs, traffic signal poles, traffic signal equipment, wheel chair ramps, granite curbing, etc) and the entire sidewalk immediately abutting the subject property if damaged as a result of construction activity. All new sidewalks and driveways must be constructed of concrete.	CO for Phase I, II, & III	ISD	
11	To the extent possible, all exterior lighting must be confined to the subject property and must not intrude, interfere or spill onto neighboring properties.	CO for Phase I, II, & III	ISD	
12	All construction materials and equipment must be stored onsite. If occupancy of the street layout is required, such occupancy must be in conformance with the requirements of the Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices and the prior approval of the Traffic and Parking Department must be obtained.	Construction of Phase I, II & III	ISD / T&P	

13	Interim plan for Butler drive shall be developed, subject to Plng and T&P staff approval and implemented as outlined below.	BP for Phase II	Plng / T&P	Complete
14	The following site improvements shall be completed before final COs are issued for Phase 1; a. parking, landscaping within boundaries of phase 1 as shown on phasing plan dated 3.28.09 and stamped into the OSPCD on May 15, 2009	Final COs for Phase 1	Plng / T&P	
15	The following site improvements shall be completed before building permits are <u>Certificate of Occupancy</u> is issued for Phase 2; a. interim Butler Drive Plan	CO- BP for Phase II	T&P	
16	The following site improvements shall be completed before final COs are issued for Phase 2; a. parking, landscaping within boundaries of phase 2 as shown on plan dated 3.28.09 and stamped into the OSPCD on May 15, 2009 b. improvements to the intersection of Temple Street and Memorial Road as outlined in original permit c. completion of all Butler Drive work as shown on the Master Plan site plan dated 4.28.09 d. completion of access way onto Memorial Road	CO for Phase II	Plng / T&P	
17	The following site improvements shall be completed before final COs are issued for Phase 3; a. parking, landscaping within boundaries of phase 3 as shown on phasing plan dated 3.28.09 and stamped into the OSPCD on May 15, 2009	CO for Phase III	Plng / T&P	
18	Applicant will screen the dumpster with fencing that blocks view of the dumpster itself.	CO	Plng.	
19	Applicant shall reevaluate the price and maintenance costs of the asphalt shingle walkway roofs and is encouraged to replace these with metal standing seam roofs. The Applicant may change these to metal standing seam roofs with approval from the Planning Director.	BP for Phase II	Plng.	
20	Applicant shall evaluate whether Buildings E and F can be modified so that the walkways presently planned for the courtyard can instead face the parking lot and is encouraged to make this modification, if feasible. The Applicant may revise these facades accordingly with approval from the Planning Director.	BP for Phase II	Plng.	
21	The Applicant shall contact Planning Staff at least five working days in advance of a request for a final sign-off on the building permit to ensure the proposal was constructed in accordance with the plans and information submitted and the conditions attached to this approval.	Final sign off	Plng.	
22	The Applicant shall present building material and color samples as well as a planting schedule to <u>Planning Staff and the Design Review Committee</u> for review and comment prior to construction.	BP for <u>Phase III</u>	Plng.	
23	<u>The Applicant shall present the pavement materials/markings for the cul-de-sac and surrounding walkway to Planning Staff for review and comment prior to construction.</u>	<u>BP for Phase III</u>	<u>Plng.</u>	

24	<u>The Applicants shall make best efforts to work with the Church to make the improvements to the plaza in front of the church as shown on the site plan.</u>	<u>CO for Phase III</u>	<u>Plng.</u>	
----	---	-------------------------	--------------	--

